## What is relevant and what is redundant?

#### M. ROSÁRIO OLIVEIRA

CEMAT AND DEPT. MATEMÁTICA, IST-ULISBOA



## FEATURE SELECTION: Only the "*right"* features





More data is not necessarily more information...



#### TURE SELECTION: THE RIGHT DATA

#### **Feature Selection:**

• Extract from the data **useful** and **valuable** knowledge for **real problem solving** 



- Select a small subset of the original features
- Such that we remove irrelevant and redundant features
- In order to:
  - Reduce computational complexity
  - Improve model accuracy
  - Increase model interpretability





**Idea:** search for feature subsets, using the classifier accuracy as the measure of utility for a candidate subset

#### Disadvantages:

- computational cost
- selected features are classifier specific

• Example:

• Stepwise regression



**Idea:** Classifier estimations and feature selection are not separated and interact

#### Disadvantages:

- Selected features are classifier specific
- Regularized\_OF=OF+λregularization\_penalty

• Example:

• Regularization methods

## FILTER METHODS

- **Idea:** Classifier's estimation and feature selection are separated and depend on a specific measure of benefit
- Most popular ones: rely on Mutual Information (MI) and Entropy
- Mutual Information: measures linear and non-linear associations among features

### **Example:**

• Forward feature selection methods based on MI

# ENTROPY, MUTUAL INFORMATION



## Entropy

#### Entropy



## Motivated by problems in the field of telecommunications

A Mathematical Theory of Communication\*

C. E. Shannon (1948)

- A measure of uncertainty
- One formula that changed the world...

$$H(\boldsymbol{X}) = -\sum_{\boldsymbol{x} \in \mathcal{X}} P(\boldsymbol{X} = \boldsymbol{x}) \ln P(\boldsymbol{X} = \boldsymbol{x}).$$

Entropy

**Discrete rv** 

- Does not depend on the values of X, only on its prob.
- H(a)=0
- H(X)≥0, Non-negative
- H(X)=ln(n), X~Unif{a<sub>1</sub>,...,a<sub>n</sub>}, is maximum

#### Differential Entropy Continous rv

$$h(\boldsymbol{X}) = -\int_{\boldsymbol{x}\in\mathcal{X}} f_{\boldsymbol{X}}(\boldsymbol{x}) \ln f_{\boldsymbol{X}}(\boldsymbol{x}) d\boldsymbol{x}.$$

- Does not depend on the values of X, only on its pdf
- Can be negative
- h(X)=ln(a), X~Unif(0,a),
  - a=1, h(X)=0
  - a<1, h(X)<0

#### Mutual Information Discrete rv

#### Mutual Information Continuous rv

$$\mathsf{MI}(X,Y) = \sum_{\mathbf{x}\in\mathcal{X}}\sum_{\mathbf{y}\in\mathcal{Y}}P(\mathbf{X}=\mathbf{x},\mathbf{Y}=\mathbf{y})\ln\frac{P(\mathbf{X}=\mathbf{x},\mathbf{Y}=\mathbf{y})}{P(\mathbf{X}=\mathbf{x})P(\mathbf{Y}=\mathbf{y})}.$$
$$\mathsf{MI}(X,Y) = -\int_{\mathbf{y}\in\mathcal{Y}}\int_{\mathbf{x}\in\mathcal{X}}f_{X,Y}(\mathbf{x},\mathbf{y})\ln\frac{f_{X,Y}(\mathbf{x},\mathbf{y})}{f_X(\mathbf{x})f_Y(\mathbf{y})}d\mathbf{x}d\mathbf{y}.$$

#### • Measures linear and non-linear associations between **X** and **Y**

- $MI(\mathbf{X},\mathbf{Y}) \ge 0$
- Symmetric
- MI(X,Y)=0 iff  $X \coprod Y$
- MI(**X**,**X**)=H(**X**)

- All properties hold, except
- MI(**X**,**X)**=+∞

# FORWARD FEATURE SELECTION



## FORWARD FEATURE SELECTION

**Goal:** Select a **small subset** of the original features, excluding **irrelevant** and **redundant** features



## FORWARD FEATURE SELECTION





 $OF(X_i) = MI(C, S) + MI(C, X_i | S)$ = MI(C, S) + MI(C, X\_i) - TMI(C, X\_i, S) = MI(C, S) + MI(C, X\_i) - MI(X\_i, S) + MI(X\_i, S | C).



## **OBJECTIVE FUNCTIONS:** INTERPRETABILITY

 $X_j = \arg \max_{X_i \in F} MI(C, S \cup \{X_i\}).$ 

$$\mathsf{Max} \quad \mathsf{OF}(X_i) = \mathsf{MI}(C, S) + \mathsf{MI}(C, X_i | S)$$

$$OF(X_i) = H(C) - H(C|X_i, S)$$
, min

$$OF(X_i) = MI(C, S) + MI(C, X_i|S) = MI(C, S) + MI(C, X_i) - TMI(C, X_i, S)$$
$$= MI(C, S) + MI(C, X_i) - MI(X_i, S) + MI(X_i, S|C).$$

## **OBJECTIVE FUNCTIONS:** INTERPRETABILITY

 $X_j = \arg \max_{X_i \in \mathbf{F}} \operatorname{MI}(C, \mathbf{S} \cup \{X_i\}).$ 

 $OF(X_i) = MI(C, S) + MI(C, X_i|S)$ = MI(C, S) + MI(C, X\_i) - TMI(C, X\_i, S) = MI(C, S) + MI(C, X\_i) - MI(X\_i, S) - MI(X\_i, S|C).

RelevanceInter-featureClass-relevantredundanceRedundancy••••••

## FEATURE SELECTION METHODS





## FORWARD FEATURE SELECTION METHODS JRD GROUP

### **Third Group of Methods**

| Method | Objective function evaluated at $X_{i}$  |
|--------|--|
| CIFE   | $MI(C, X_i) - \sum_{X_s \in S} (MI(X_i, X_s) - MI(X_i, X_s   C))$                |
| JMI    | $MI(C, X_i) = \frac{1}{ S } \sum_{X_i \in S} (MI(X_i, X_s) - MI(X_i, X_s   C))$  |
| CMIM   | $MI(C, X_i) = \max_{X_s \in S} \{MI(X_i, X_s) = MI(X_i, X_s   C)\}$              |
| JMIM   | $MI(C, X_i) = \max_{X_i \in S} \{MI(X_i, X_s) = MI(X_i, X_s   C) = MI(C, X_s)\}$ |
| OFD    | $MM(X_i) = MI(X_i, C) - max MI(X_i, X_i) + max MI(X_i, X_i)C$                    |

 Class-relevant redundancy: contribution of a candidate feature to the explanation of the class, when taken together with already selected features

# THEORETICAL COMPARISON





## NUMERICAL COMPARISON:

### How comparisons are usually done:





# 2. THEORETICAL COMPARISON:

**USING A DISTRIBUTIONAL SETTING** 

## **Theoretical Setup:**

Class-Variable: 
$$C_k = \begin{cases} 0, & X + kY < 0 \\ 1, & X + kY \ge 0 \end{cases}$$

Candidate Features: X, X-k'Y, X<sub>Disc</sub>, Z



## FEATURE (RELEVANCE) TYPES

- **Class-Variable**:  $C_k = \begin{cases} 0, & X + kY < 0 \\ 1, & X + kY \ge 0 \end{cases}$
- Candidate Features: X, X-k'Y, X<sub>Disc</sub>, Z

## **Features Categories:**

- Irrelevant: Z
- *Relevant:* X, X-k'Y, X<sub>Disc</sub>
  - Fully Relevant: X-k'Y
- Redundant:
  - If we chose X then X<sub>Disc</sub> is redundant
  - If we chose X<sub>Disc</sub> then X is redundant





**Features Order:** OF were calculated theoretically assuming X, Y, and Z are indep. N(0,1)

#### **Performance Measure:**

Bayes Risk and Bayes Classifier = min{Total Probability of Misclassifiction}

#### **THEORETICAL COMPARISON**

| Α                              | $MI(C_k,A)$   |   |  |  | The desired probability density function is  | $= \int_{-\frac{k}{2}}^{+\infty} \phi(z)\phi(v + k'z)dz;$   | functions. In the case of $v \ge 0$ , it is simply 0 = pendency on v. As for $v < 0$ ,  |
|--------------------------------|---|---|--|--|--|---|---|
| X X - k'Y Z                    | $\frac{\frac{1}{2}\ln(2\pi e)}{\frac{1}{2}\ln(2\pi e)}$ | $ (1+k^{\prime 2}) - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{j=0}^{1} \int_{\mathbb{R}} f_{X C_{k}=j}(u) (1+k^{\prime 2}) - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{j=0}^{1} \int_{\mathbb{R}} f_{X C_{k}=j}(u) $ | $\ln f_{X C_k=j}(u)du$<br>$f_{X-k'Y C_k=j}(u)\ln f_{X-k'Y}$  | $_{Y C_k=j}(u)du$                                | $f_{X-k'Y X_{mx}=1,\zeta_k=0}(\nu) = \begin{cases} \frac{2\pi}{\pi-\arctan k} \int_{-\frac{\nu}{k'}}^{\frac{\nu}{k'+k'}} \phi(z)\phi(\nu+k'z)dz, & \nu \ge 0\\ 0, & \nu < 0 \end{cases}$   | while, for $v < 0$ ,<br>$d \left[ \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} dv v dv v dv v dv dv dv dv v dv dv v dv d$   | $\frac{d}{d\nu} \left[ \int_{-\frac{\nu}{\nu',k}}^{-\frac{\nu}{\nu',k}} \phi(z) \Phi(\nu + k'z) dz + \frac{1}{2} F_{SN(0,1,-k)} \right] \left( -\frac{1}{2} \int_{-\frac{\nu}{\nu',k}}^{-\frac{\nu}{\nu',k}} \phi(z) \Phi(\nu + k'z) dz + \frac{1}{2} \int_{-\frac{\nu}{\nu',k}}^{-\frac{\nu}{\nu',k}} \phi(z) \Phi(\nu + k'z) dz + \frac{1}$ |
| X <sub>disc</sub>              | $2\ln(2) +$   | $\frac{\arctan k}{\pi} \ln(\frac{\arctan k}{2\pi}) + (1 + 1)$   | $-\frac{\arctan k}{\pi}$ ) $\ln(\frac{1}{2}-\frac{\arctan k}{2\pi})$   | $\frac{\operatorname{an} k}{\pi}$ ) <sup>b</sup> | We finally consider $u = 0$ and $i = 0$ . For $v > 0$  | $\frac{dv}{dv} \left[ \int_{-\frac{1}{V}} \phi(z) \phi(v + k^2) dz - \frac{1}{2} \phi(k^2) \right]$   | $= \int_{-\frac{\pi}{k',k}} \phi(z)\phi(\nu + k'z)dz + \frac{1}{2}f_{SN(0,1,-k)} \left(-\right)$  |
| <sup>a</sup> $X C_k = j$       | ~ SN(0, 1,  | $\frac{(-1)^{j+1}}{k}$ , $j = 0, 1.$  | 1.14   |  | $P(X - kY \le v, X_{disc} = 0, C_k = 0)$   | $= \int_{-\frac{\nu}{\nu}}^{+\infty} \phi(z)\phi(\nu + k'z)dz + \frac{1}{2}\phi(\frac{\nu}{k'})\frac{1}{k'} - \frac{1}{2}\phi(\frac{\nu}{k'})\frac{1}{k'}$  | $-\frac{1}{2}\phi\left(\frac{\nu}{k'}\right)\frac{1}{k'}-\frac{1}{2}f_{SN(0,1,-k)}\left(-\frac{\nu}{k'+k}\right)\frac{1}{k'}$   |
| $^{D} X - k'Y 0$               | $C_k = j \sim SN$                                       | $N(0, \sqrt{1 + k^2}, (-1)^{j+1})$  | $(\frac{1-kk'}{k+k'})), \ j=0,1.$  |  | $= \int_{-\infty}^{0} \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} dy (y) dy(z) dy dz = \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{0} dy (y) dy(z) dz dy$  | $= \int_{-r}^{+\infty} \phi(z)\phi(v+k'z)dz.$   | $= \int_{-\infty}^{-\frac{x}{\nu}} \phi(z)\phi(\nu + k'z)dz.$   |
| Table 8                        |   |   |  |  | $= \int_{-\infty} \int_{-\infty} \varphi(n) \varphi(z) u n u z = \int_{0} \int_{-kz} \varphi(n) \varphi(z) u z u n$  | Note that the following important result [5]. Ch. 3] was required   | d-1/12  |
| MI between                     | n pairs of  | input features.   |  |  | $-\int_{-\infty}^{k'}\int_{y+kz}^{z}\phi(w)\phi(z)dzdw$  | in order to obtain both final expressions above:  | Once again, (A.4) was applied, in this case<br>k'r)dr.  |
| <u>A</u>                       | B   | $MI(\cdot, \cdot)$  |  |  | $=\frac{1}{2}-\int_{0}^{0}\phi(z)\left[\Phi(-kz)-\frac{1}{2}\right]dz-\int_{0}^{-\frac{1}{p}}\left[\frac{1}{2}-\Phi(y+k'z)\right]\phi(z)dz$  | $\frac{d}{dx} \int_{a(x)}^{b(x)} g(x, y) dy$  | The desired probability density function is   |
| X X X - k'Y                    | X - KY<br>$X_{disc}$<br>$X_{disc}$                      | $\frac{\frac{1}{2}\ln(1+\frac{1}{k^2})}{\ln(2)}$ $\frac{1}{2}\ln(2\pi e) - \frac{1}{2}\sum_{i=1}^{1}$   | $\int_{\mathbb{R}} \int_{\mathbb{R}} f_{X C_{i,i}=j}(u) \ln f_{X C_{i}}$   | u_=j(u)du ³                                      | $= \frac{3}{4} - \frac{1}{2}F_{SN(0,1-k)}(0) - \frac{1}{2}\Phi\left(-\frac{\nu}{\nu}\right) + \int^{-\frac{\nu}{k'}} \Phi(\nu + k'z)\phi(z)dz.$  | $= \int_{a(x)}^{b(x)} \frac{dg(x,y)}{dx} dy + g(x,b(x))b'(x) - g(x,a(x))a'(x).  (A.4)$  | $f_{X-kY X_{like}=0,f_k=1}(\nu) = \begin{cases} 0, \\ \frac{2\pi}{\pi \tau \tan k} \int_{-\frac{\pi}{k',k}}^{-\frac{\pi}{k'}} \phi(z) \phi(\nu) \end{cases}$  |
| Ζ                              | В   | $\tilde{0}, B \in \{X, X - k'Y, X\}$  | (disc)   | × -  | 4 2 $K = J_{-\infty}$  | This result was applied to $\frac{d}{d\nu}\int_{-\frac{1}{k'-k}}^{+\infty}\phi(z)\Phi(\nu+k'z)\mathrm{d}z,$ in the ex-  | We now consider $u = 1$ and $j = 0$ . For $v \ge 0$   |
| <sup>a</sup> $X C_{k'} =$      | $j \sim SN(0,$  | $1, \frac{(-1)^{j+1}}{k'}), \ j = 0, 1.$  |  |  | $P(X - kY \le v X_{ex} = 0, C = 0)$  | pression for $v \ge 0$ , and also to $\frac{d}{dv} \int_{-\frac{1}{k'}}^{+\frac{v}{v}} \phi(z) \Phi(v + k'z) dz$ , concerning   | $P(X - k'Y \le v, X_{disc} = 1, C_k = 0)$   |
| Α                              |   | В   | $MI(\cdot, \cdot   C_k)$   |  | $\int \frac{1}{ t ^2} \int \frac{1}{ t ^2} $ | The desired probability density function is   | $= \int_{-\frac{p}{p^2}} \int_{0} \phi(w)\phi(z)dw dz + \int_{-\frac{p}{p^2}} \int_{0} \int_{0} \phi(w)\phi(z)dw dz + \int_{-\frac{p}{p^2}} \int_{0} \phi(w)\phi(z)dw dz + \int_{0} \phi(w)\phi(w)\phi(z)dw dz + \int_{0} \phi(w)\phi(w)\phi(z)dw dz + \int_{0} \phi(w)\phi(w)\phi(w)\phi(w)\phi(w)\phi(w)\phi(w)\phi(w)\phi(w)\phi(w)$   |
| X                              |   | X - k'Y   | $1 \Sigma^1$ (f)   | $(u) \ln f$                                      | $-\int_{-\infty}\int_{-\infty}\phi(w)\phi(z)dwdz + \int_{-\frac{v}{v-v}}\int_{-\infty}\phi(w)\phi(z)dzdw$  | $\int_{X-bYK_{d_{2}}-1,f_{k-1}}(v) = \begin{cases} \frac{2\pi}{\pi-\arctan}\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty}\phi(x)\phi(v+k'x)dx, & v \ge 0\\ \frac{2\pi}{\pi-\arctan}\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty}\phi(x)\phi(v+k'x)dx, & v \ge 0 \end{cases}$ | $= \int_{-\frac{\pi}{2}}^{-\frac{\pi}{2}/3} \phi(z) \left[ \Phi(v + k'z) - \frac{1}{2} \right] dz$  |
|                                |   |   | $\frac{1}{2} \sum_{j=0}^{2} \int_{\mathbb{R}} f_{X-k'Y }$ $\frac{1}{2} \sum_{j=0}^{1} \int_{\mathbb{R}} f_{X-k'Y }$ $(1 + \ln \pi + \ln k')$   | $ C_{k=j}(u) \ln \int X_{ C }$                   | $=\int_{-\infty}^{-\frac{p}{k'+k}}\Phi(v+k'z)\phi(z)dwdz+\int_{-\frac{p}{k'+k}}^{+\infty}\Phi(-kz)\phi(z)dz$   | $\frac{1}{\pi - \operatorname{arcunk}} \int_{-\frac{\pi}{T}} \phi(z) \phi(v + \kappa z) dz,  v < 0$<br>We now consider $u = 0$ and $j = 1$ . We have to split again in two  | $+\int_{-\frac{1}{k^{2}}}^{0}\phi(z)\left[\Phi(-kz)-\frac{1}{2}\right]dzdw$   |
| X                              |   | X <sub>disc</sub>   | $\frac{-\frac{\arctan k}{\pi}}{\frac{\arctan k}{\pi}}\ln(\frac{\arctan k}{\pi})$   | $-(1-\frac{ar}{a})$                              | $= \int_{-\infty}^{-\frac{\nu}{k'+k}} \Phi(\nu + k'z) \phi(z) dz + \frac{1}{2} - \frac{1}{2} F_{SN(0,1,-k)} \left( -\frac{\nu}{k'+k} \right).$   | cases. For $v \ge 0$ ,<br>$P(X - kY \le v, X_{disc} = 0, C_k = 1) = \int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{0} \phi(w)\phi(z)dz dw$  | $= \int_{-\frac{1}{k'+1}}^{-\frac{1}{k'+1}} \phi(z)\Phi(v+k'z)dz - \frac{1}{2} \left[ \Phi\left(-\frac{v}{k'+k'+1}\right) + \frac{1}{k'+1} \right] \Phi(v+k'z)dz$   |
| X - k'Y                        |   | X <sub>disc</sub>   | $\frac{1}{2}\sum_{i=1}^{1}\int_{Y_{i}}f_{Y_{i}}$ is a first second   | (u) In fy  | We again need to take the derivative of the two expressions<br>with respect to a to obtain the corresponding conditional density   | $-\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} \phi(z) \left[\frac{1}{2} - \phi(-iz)\right] dz$   | + $\frac{1}{2} \left[ F_{SN(0,1,-k)}(0) - F_{SN(0,1,-k)} \left( - \frac{\nu}{k'+k} \right) \right]$   |
|                                |   |   | $2 \sum_{J=0} \int \mathbb{R} \int X - k' Y   C_k = h(X - k'Y   X_{\text{disc}}, C_k)$   | $)^{b,c}$  | functions. In the case of $\nu \ge 0$ ,  | $-J_0 \qquad (2 - \sqrt{2})$  | $= \int_{-\infty}^{-\frac{\nu}{\nu_{th}}} \phi(z) \Phi(\nu + k'z) dz - \frac{1}{2} \Phi\left(\frac{\nu}{k' + k}\right)$   |
| Ζ                              |   | В   | $0, B \in \{X, X - k'Y, \ldots, k'Y, $ | X <sub>disc</sub> }                              | $\frac{d}{d} \left[ \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{E_{r}} \exp(\theta) - \frac{1}{2} \Phi(-\frac{\nu}{2}) + \int_{-\frac{\nu}{2}}^{\frac{1}{\nu}} \Phi(\nu + k'_{2}) \phi(z) dz \right]$   | $=\frac{1}{2} r_{SN(0,1,-k)}(0) - \frac{1}{4}$  | $+\frac{1}{2}F_{0(0,1-2)}(0) - \frac{1}{2}F_{0(0,1-2)}(-\frac{\nu}{1-1-1}).$  |
| <sup>a</sup> $X C_{k'} =$      | $j \sim SN(0)$  | $(1, \frac{(-1)^{j+1}}{k'}), \ j = 0, 1.$   | A 4  | R  | $\frac{dv}{dv} \begin{bmatrix} 4 & 2^{-SN(0,1,k)} \\ 2 & 2 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} k \\ k \end{bmatrix} + \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} e^{i(t+k-1)t} e^{i(t$  | For v < 0,  | $\sum_{k=1}^{n} \sum_{k=1}^{n} \sum_{k$   |
| b X - k'Y                      | $ C_k = j \sim$   | $SN(0, \sqrt{1 + k^2}, (-1)^3)$   | J+1 71   | D  | Wi((', ')  | $P(X - kY \le v, X_{disc} = 0, C_k = 1)$<br>$e^{-\frac{1}{2}} e^{v+k^2} e^{-\frac{1}{2}} e^{v-k^2}$   | We now need to take the derivative with   |
| $\sim n(X - K)$                | $\frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{2}$                               | $\frac{k}{k^{2}} = \frac{k^{2}}{k^{2}}$   | X  | X - k'Y  | $\frac{1}{2}\ln(1+\frac{1}{k^2})$  | $= \int_{-\frac{w}{y+k}}^{w} \int_{-kx}^{-kx} \phi(w)\phi(z)dw dz + \int_{-\frac{w}{y-k}}^{w} \int_{-kx}^{-kx} \phi(w)\phi(z)dz dw$   | expression obtained for $v \ge 0$ (the derivative o<br>0) to obtain the corresponding conditional d   |
| /7                             | (   | 1   | X  | X <sub>disc</sub>                                | $\ln(2)$<br>$1\ln(2\pi a) = 1\sum_{i=1}^{n} \int f_{i} f_{i}(x) \ln f_{i}(x) dx dx$  | $= \int_{-\frac{1}{2}}^{-\frac{1}{2}} \phi(z) [\Phi(v + k'z) - \Phi(-kz)] dz$   | have director in the matrix   |
| $=\frac{\sqrt{2}}{\sqrt{1+1}}$ | $\frac{1}{k^2}$   | $\sqrt{2\pi}\sqrt{1+k^2}(k+k)$  | $\frac{\kappa}{1} e^{-\kappa r}$   | Adisc<br>R                                       | $\frac{1}{2} \prod (2\pi e) - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{j=0} \int_{\mathbb{R}} J_X _{C_{k'}=j}(u) \prod J_X _{C_{k'}=j}(u) du$   | $\int_{-\frac{1}{2}}^{+\infty} dx = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & dx & b \end{bmatrix} dx dx$   | $\frac{d}{d\nu} \left[ \int_{-\frac{1}{\nu}}^{\frac{1}{\nu}} \phi(z) \Phi(\nu + k'z) dz - \frac{1}{2} \Phi\left( -\frac{\nu}{k'+1} \right) \right]$   |
|                                | (1  | -kk')z  |  |  | $(1)^{j+1}$  | $+\int_{-\frac{1}{2}} \varphi(z) \left[\frac{1}{2} - \varphi(-kz)\right] dz dw$   | $-\frac{1}{2}F_{3N(0,1,-k)}\left(-\frac{\nu}{k'+k}\right)$  |
| × Ф(                           | (k-k)   | $(\sqrt{1+k'^2})^{dz}$  | <sup>a</sup> $X C_{k'}=j$  | $\sim SN(0,$                                     | $1, \frac{(-1)}{k'}, j = 0, 1.$  | $= \int_{-\frac{k}{k'x}}^{-\frac{k}{k'x}} \phi(z) \Phi(v + k'z) dz - \frac{1}{2} \left[ F_{2N(0,1,-k)} \left( -\frac{v}{k'} \right) \right]$  | $= \int_{-\pi}^{\frac{\pi}{\nu+k}} \phi(z)\phi(\nu+k'z)dz - \frac{1}{2}\phi\left(-\frac{\nu}{k'+k}\right)$  |

 $P(X - k'Y \le v, X_{disc} = 1, C_k =$ tions. In the case of  $v \ge 0$ , it is simply 0 since there is no de- $=\int_{-\frac{w}{w',z}}^{0}\int_{-kz}^{w+k'z}\phi(w)\phi(z)dw$  $\int_{-\frac{\nu}{k'}}^{-\frac{\nu}{k'}} \phi(z) \Phi(\nu + k'z) dz + \frac{1}{2} F_{2N(0,1,-k)} \left(-\frac{\nu}{k'+k}\right) + \frac{1}{2} \Phi\left(\frac{\nu}{k'}\right)$  $\frac{-\frac{\nu}{\nu}}{r^{2}}\phi(z)\phi(\nu+k'z)dz + \frac{1}{2}f_{SN(0,1,-k)}\left(-\frac{\nu}{k'+k}\right)\frac{1}{k'+k}$  $=\int_{-\frac{z}{2}}^{0}\phi(z)[\Phi(v+k'z) \frac{1}{2}\phi\binom{\nu}{k'}\frac{1}{k'} - \frac{1}{2}f_{\text{SN}(0,1,-k)}\left(-\frac{\nu}{k'+k}\right)\frac{1}{k'+k} + \frac{1}{2}\phi\binom{\nu}{k'}\frac{1}{k'}$  $+\int_{0}^{+\infty}\phi(z)\left[\Phi(v+k'z)-\right]$  $= \int_{-\frac{\nu}{2}}^{0} \phi(z) \Phi(\nu + k'z) dz$ again, (A.4) was applied, in this case to  $\int_{-\frac{\pi}{1-\mu}}^{-\frac{\pi}{1-\mu}} \phi(z) \Phi(\nu +$  $-F_{SN(0,1,-k)}\left(-\frac{v}{k'+k}\right) +$  $_{kY|K_{line}=0, f_{k}=1}^{}(\nu) = \begin{cases} 0, & \nu \ge 0\\ \frac{2\pi}{n \text{ transk}} \int_{-\frac{1}{\nu/\lambda}}^{-\frac{\nu}{\nu}} \phi(z) \phi(\nu + k'z) dz, & \nu < 0 \end{cases}$ **(**<sup>+∞</sup> .  $\int_{-\frac{v}{k' z^{2}}}^{+\infty} \frac{2\pi}{\pi - \arctan k} \zeta(z, v) dz \bigg)$ Ve now consider u = 1 and j = 0. For  $v \ge 0$ ,  $\frac{2\pi}{\frac{\nu}{r'+k}}\frac{2\pi}{\pi-\arctan k}\zeta(z,\nu)dz\Big)d\nu$  $\int_{-\frac{\pi}{2}}^{\frac{\pi}{2}+k'z} \int_{0}^{\nu+k'z} \phi(w)\phi(z)dw \, dz + \int_{-\frac{\pi}{2}+k}^{0} \int_{0}^{-kz} \phi(w)\phi(z)dz \, dw$  $\int_{-\infty}^{\frac{y}{k'+k}} \frac{2\pi}{\pi - \arctan k} \zeta(z, v) dz$  $\sum_{v=1}^{\frac{v}{r+k}} \frac{2\pi}{\pi - \arctan k} \zeta(z, v) dz dv$  $\int_{\frac{w}{2}}^{\frac{w}{2}+1} \phi(z) \Phi(v+k'z) dz - \frac{1}{2} \left[ \Phi\left(-\frac{v}{k'+k}\right) - \Phi\left(-\frac{v}{k'}\right) \right]$  $\int_{-\infty}^{\frac{\nu}{k'}} \frac{2\pi}{\pi - \arctan k} \zeta(z, \nu) dz \right)$  $\frac{1}{2} \left[ F_{SN(0,1,-k)}(0) - F_{SN(0,1,-k)} \left( -\frac{\nu}{k'+k} \right) \right] - \frac{1}{2} \Phi \left( \frac{\nu}{k'+k} \right)$  $\left(\frac{2\pi}{\pi - \arctan k}\zeta(z, v)dz\right)dv$  $\frac{2\pi}{\arctan k}\zeta(z,v)dz)$ or the case v < 0,  $P(X - k'Y \le v, X_{disc} = 1, C_k = 0) = 0$ . need to take the derivative with respect to v of the  $\frac{\partial \psi}{\partial v_{+k}} \frac{2\pi}{\arctan k} \zeta(z, v) dz dv$ ession obtained for  $v \ge 0$  (the derivative of the one for v < 0 is obtain the corresponding conditional density functions. We  $\int_{-\frac{1}{2}}^{\frac{1}{2}} \phi(z) \Phi(\nu + k'z) dz - \frac{1}{2} \Phi\left(-\frac{\nu}{k' + k}\right) + \frac{1}{2} F_{SN(0,1,-k)}(0)$ -<u>V</u> k'+k  $\frac{2\pi}{\arctan k}\zeta(z,v)dz$ 1) k'+k  $\frac{2\pi}{\arctan k}\zeta(z,v)dz\Big)dv\Big),$  $\int_{-\infty}^{\frac{\nu}{1+k}} \phi(z)\phi(\nu+k'z)dz - \frac{1}{2}\phi\left(-\frac{\nu}{k'+k}\right)$ 



## CONCLUSIONS

- Theoretical framework for the comparison of feature selection methods.
- Derivation of <u>upper and lower bounds</u> for the target objective functions.
- Distributional setting to highlight deficiencies of feature selection methods.
- Identification of feature selection methods to be avoided and preferred.



MIM, MIFS, mRMR, maxMIFS: Ignore complementary

Main References

|         | Neurocomputing 513 (2022) 215–232                |  |
|---------|--|--|
|         | Contents lists available at ScienceDirect        |  |
|         | Neurocomputing                                   |  |
| LSEVIER | journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/neucom | Compared States one<br>Functional States |

Feature selection using Decomposed Mutual Information Maximization



Francisco Macedo<sup>a</sup>, Rui Valadas<sup>b,c,\*</sup>, Eunice Carrasquinha<sup>a,b</sup>, M. Rosário Oliveira<sup>a</sup>, António Pacheco<sup>a</sup>

Theoretical foundations of forward feature selection methods based on mutual information

Francisco Macedo<sup>a,b</sup>, M. Rosário Oliveira<sup>a,\*</sup>, António Pacheco<sup>a</sup>, Rui Valadas<sup>c</sup>

<sup>a</sup> CEMAT and Department of Mathematics, Instituto Superior Técnico, Universidade de Lisboa, Av. Rovisco Pais, Lisboa 1049–001, Portugal <sup>b</sup> EPF Lausanne, SB-MATHICSE-ANCHP, Station 8, Lausanne CH-1015, Switzerland

<sup>c</sup> IT and Departament of Electrical and Computer Engineering, Instituto Superior Técnico, Universidade de Lisboa, Av. Rovisco Pais, Lisboa 1049–001, Portugal

### Theoretical evaluation of feature selection methods based on mutual information

Cláudia Pascoal<sup>a</sup>, M. Rosário Oliveira<sup>a,\*</sup>, António Pacheco<sup>a</sup>, Rui Valadas<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup> CEMAT and Dep. Mathematics, Instituto Superior Técnico, Universidade de Lisboa, Av. Rovisco Pais, 1049-001 Lisboa, Portugal
 <sup>b</sup> IT and Dep. Electrical and Computer Engineering, Instituto Superior Técnico, Universidade de Lisboa, Av. Rovisco Pais, 1049-001 Lisboa, Portugal